

Welcome University of Oxford

[Home](#)
[Feedback](#)
[Support](#)
[Log on / Register](#)
 17-Apr-2008

[My F1000 Biology](#) | [Browse the Faculties](#) | [Top 10s](#) | [Advanced Search](#) | [My Details](#) | [About](#) |

Faculty Member List

Exceptional
F1000 Factor **9.0**

EndNote

[Download citation](#)

[Send page by email](#)

Social semantics: how useful has group selection been?

West SA, Griffin AS, Gardner A

J Evol Biol 2008 Jan **21**(1):374-85 [[abstract on PubMed](#)][[citations on Google Scholar](#)] [[related articles](#)] [[full text](#)] [[order article](#)]**Selected by** | Redouan Bshary

Evaluated 17 Apr 2008

[Relevant Sections](#)

Faculty Comments

Faculty Member

Redouan Bshary

 Université de Neuchâtel,
Switzerland
ECOLOGY

Controversial

Comments

I found this article interesting because the authors explicitly test the usefulness of the inclusive fitness approach against the group selection approach with a meta-analysis. The authors find that while both approaches are mathematically viable, the inclusive fitness approach has been significantly more influential for social evolution theory, which the authors attribute to its simplicity that generates higher explanatory power. While the two camps seem to keep their respective positions, the current paper allows all those who want to teach the issue and future generations of researchers to decide for themselves how convincing they find the arguments in favour of inclusive fitness theory.

Competing interests: None declared

Evaluated 17 Apr 2008

[How to cite this evaluation](#)

Faculty Comments

How to cite the Faculty of 1000 Biology evaluation(s) for this paper

1) To cite all the evaluations for this article:

 Faculty of 1000 Biology: evaluations for West SA et al *J Evol Biol* 2008 Jan 21 (1) :374-85
<http://www.f1000biology.com/article/id/1104801/evaluation>

2) To cite an evaluation by a specific Faculty member:

 Redouan Bshary: Faculty of 1000 Biology, 17 Apr 2008 <http://www.f1000biology.com/article/id/1104801/evaluation>

© 1999-2008 Biology Reports Ltd unless otherwise stated < info@f1000biology.com > [Terms and conditions](#) [Legal info](#)